Writing Feedback

TERM 1 2025 | DAY 2 WRITING | 15th April

Section 1:

Part #1:

Strengths:

- Your emotive language effectively conveys passion about the library's importance ("beloved," "rock for generations")
- You establish a clear thesis statement about the library's historical significance and educational value

Weakness: Emotional hyperbole \rightarrow Your writing contains several emotionally charged phrases that might undermine your credibility. Phrases like "sending a chill down my spine," "shatter our community spirit," and "pure greed of construction companies" come across as melodramatic rather than persuasive. While passion is valuable, excessive emotional language can make councillors dismiss your concerns as merely sentimental.

Exemplar: Instead of "Even the thought of our library being torn down for the pure greed of construction companies sends a chill down my spine," consider "The proposed demolition of our historic library to accommodate commercial interests raises serious concerns about preserving our community's cultural heritage."

Part #2:

Strengths:

- You create a vivid metaphorical image of historical destruction with the picture frame analogy
- You incorporate data from a neighbouring town to support your position

Weakness: Metaphor overload \rightarrow You use multiple metaphors in quick succession that become convoluted and potentially confusing. Phrases like "ripping away the souls," "splinter by splinter," "azure earthen walls," and "shadows lengthening at sunset" create a dense thicket of imagery that obscures your message rather than enhancing it. The metaphors begin to compete with each other rather than complementing your argument.

Exemplar: Rather than "The sounds of drills and hammers aren't simply breaking through walls and doors of our sacred building, they are penetrating through our cultural history like shadows lengthening at sunset," try "The proposed demolition represents more than physical destruction—it threatens to erase generations of community history and learning that cannot be replaced by retail outlets."

Part #3:

Strengths:

- You effectively use a hypothetical scenario to illustrate the practical impact on disadvantaged children
- You incorporate statistical evidence about Townsville's demographics (26% children)

Weakness: Underdeveloped counterargument \rightarrow Your counterargument section begins promisingly but lacks sufficient development and engagement with opposing viewpoints. The phrase "While shopping centres are also undeniably valuable to our community" is quickly dismissed without fully exploring the economic benefits. This creates the impression that you're unwilling to genuinely consider alternative perspectives, potentially weakening your overall argument.

Exemplar: Instead of "While shopping centres are also undeniably valuable to our community, in the fact that they will boost economic growth, I believe that the benefits of our town library far outweighs mere financial success," consider "While a new shopping centre would undoubtedly generate short-term economic growth through new jobs and increased foot traffic, these benefits must be weighed against the irreplaceable educational and cultural value the library provides across generations."

■ Your piece demonstrates passion and commitment to preserving the town library, which comes through clearly in your writing. However, your argument would benefit from more precise language that maintains emotional impact while avoiding hyperbole. The statistical evidence about youth population (26%) and Dr. Chen's study strengthens your case, but you could support your claims with more concrete examples of current library programmes and services. Additionally, your metaphors, while creative, sometimes overshadow your actual points. Try focusing on 2-3 strong, clear metaphors throughout rather than introducing new imagery in each paragraph. Your counterargument paragraph needs more substantive engagement with opposing viewpoints before refuting them. Also, consider providing specific examples of how libraries in similar communities have

positively impacted youth educational outcomes compared to towns that prioritised commercial development.

Overall Score: 43/50

Section 2:

Dear Councillor Thompson,

I am writing to you today to express my profound concern and distress regarding the upcoming demolition of our beloved Townsville Library. Even the thought of our library that has been this town's rock for generations, bringing people together and hosting community events, being torn down for the pure greed of construction companies, sends a chill down my spine. I urge you to rethink this pivotal decision that could shatter our community spirit, leaving a gaping whole [hole] in our town's sense of self. Why build yet another monolithic structure disguised as a mall, that echoes greed and overconsumption, instead of leaving our library be? Today, I [Today, I] will be telling you how our library has a vast amount of historical significance towards the people of Townsville, and how an immense library that bears knowledge and books encourages youth to read and educate themselves.

#1 Our library has been in this town for generations to come, and destroying it would be like ripping away the souls of children and adults, past and present, splinter by splinter. Our cries of pain and helplessness will be drowned out by the affluent and greedy, who would much prefer a shopping centre over a library. However, the fact that individuals enjoy indulging in materialistic bliss itself, is not the problem, it's the fact that companies are willing to demolish centuries worth of knowledge for that. Picture this- the photo frame of the Townsville Library founder hangs on the library's azure, earthen walls, yet the drilling, hammering, and crashing of hammers, drills, and chainsaws is pressure enough to shatter the glass frame, cracking its historical significance. The sounds of the drills and hammers that you hear, aren't simply to [for] breaking through the walls and doors of our sacred building, they are penetrating through our cultural history like shadows lengthening at sunset, slowly replacing it with consumerism and pure material goods. Moreover, the demolition of a library for a shopping centre occurred [occurred] in

our neighbouring town, and a poll conducted reported a 17% decline in community spirit and happiness in the town.

#2 Picture this- an underprivileged child goes to the library, to borrow the study materials he [they] needs [need], yet when they walks [walk] to the library, they notice that their beloved library that has supported their education even in times of need, has been replaced by a towering shopping mall, and now, they would need to pay for the materials that they might not be able to afford. If the upcoming demolition of our library is executed, this could become a reality for many students in Townsville. However, you might say "This statement could be completely invalid if the percentage of children in Townsville is low". However, in contrast to what the public may think, Townsville's population is comprised of 26% children. When such a staggering statistic, that almost 1 in 4 people in Townsville are children, it goes without saying that if we keep our library, it will propel students further in their academic success, making the library a valuable asset to our community. Dr Sarah Chen, a youth psychologist conducted a study that reported that children are 2.3 times more likely to do or follow what they are influenced by, or exposed to. The choice is left in your hands, would you rather expose children to a shopping centre that would introduce them with destructive concepts such as greed and consumerism, or continue presenting children with a library that echoes with knowledge and education? While shopping centres are also undeniably valuable to our community, in the fact that they will boost economic growth, I believe that the benefits of our town library far outweighs [outweigh] mere financial success.

#3 To conclude, while shopping centres definitely bear short term benefits such as providing customers with retail therapy and economic growth, I believe that the Townsville library will reap slow, but effective benefits such as education, humility and personal growth in children that will help tomorrows [tomorrow's] leaders excel in the long term.