Writing Feedback

TERM 1 2025 | WEEK 10 - Year 5 Scholarship Essentials

Section 1:

#1 Strengths: Your introduction effectively creates a vivid mental image of an untouched paradise with phrases like "emerald peaks transcend the clouds" and "whispers of ancient trees". You've also clearly established the purpose of the writing—to outline rules for a new society.

Weakness: Underdeveloped premise \rightarrow Your introduction presents an intriguing concept but doesn't fully establish the context for why these specific law categories were chosen. The transition from describing this paradise to announcing "We'll enforce laws" feels abrupt. For instance, when you write "Throughout history, civilisations have risen and fallen in their quest for the ideal society", you could strengthen this by briefly mentioning which specific historical lessons informed your choices.

Consider expanding with: "From the environmental devastation of the Industrial Revolution to the cultural erasure of colonialism, history offers us clear warnings about what to avoid in our new society."

#2 Strengths: You've provided a clear explanation of why preserving indigenous cultures is important, and your historical reference to British colonisation in Australia adds relevant context to your argument.

Weakness: Oversimplified historical comparison \rightarrow Your comparison to British colonisation of Australia, while relevant, is presented in a simplified manner that doesn't capture the full complexity of this historical trauma. When you write "almost wiping out the entire aboriginal population because they rejected the idea of indigenous peoples having rights", you're addressing an important issue but in a way that compresses centuries of complex history into a single sentence. This risks diminishing the ongoing impacts of colonisation that continue today.

"Like this, we can avoid repeating colonial injustices such as those experienced by Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples in Australia, where cultural practices were banned, languages were lost, and communities were devastated through policies that failed to recognise their sovereignty and rights."

#3 Strengths: Your section on "Social Harmony and Exploration" effectively balances the human desire to explore with the need to protect resources from exploitation. The concept of designated "safe zones" is an interesting governance approach.

Weakness: Limited elaboration of concepts \rightarrow This section introduces important ideas but doesn't fully develop them. Your rule "Exploration to discover new things, but not to exploit them" leaves

questions about how exploitation would be defined or prevented. Similarly, "No fighting—safe zone" is vague about what constitutes fighting and how conflicts would be resolved in practice. When you conclude with "so everybody can stay peaceful together", you could strengthen this by outlining some specific mechanisms for maintaining peace.

"Trained mediators would help resolve disagreements through dialogue rather than conflict, while community councils would determine whether exploration projects serve collective knowledge or merely private gain."

Score: 42/50

■ Your piece presents a thoughtful vision for an ideal society with strong foundations in environmental sustainability, cultural respect, and peaceful coexistence. The three-part structure works well to organise your ideas. However, the depth of your rules could be improved by providing more concrete examples of how they would be implemented in practice. For instance, when discussing buildings that "blend in with the environment," you could describe what materials would be used or what architectural styles would be encouraged. Additionally, your writing would benefit from more specific details about governance—who would enforce these rules and how? Would decisions be made democratically or through another system? Also, consider addressing potential challenges to your ideal society. What if people disagree about what constitutes "responsible" trading or "unsustainable" practices? Including some acknowledgment of these complexities would strengthen your argument. Finally, your conclusion could be expanded to explain how these three sets of rules would work together as a cohesive system.

Section 2:

Imagine a land untouched by civilisation, where emerald peaks transcend the clouds, and the whispers of ancient trees tell stories of forgotten worlds. What kind of rules would you create to preserve paradise while nurturing its people? This newly discovered land offers humanity a second chance to build a society that harmonises with nature and embraces equality and innovation. Here, we will rewrite the rules of coexistence. #1 Throughout history, civilisations have risen and fallen in their quest for the ideal society. With this uncharted land, we have the chance to learn from their mistakes and create something extraordinary. We'll enforce laws regarding environmental sustainability, cultural and ethical values and social harmony and exploration.

1. Environmental Sustainability

- All buildings and structures must blend in with the environment
- No polluting

- No unsustainable practices like deforestation and overhunting
- Waterwheels for eco-friendly energy sources

Why we should implement these laws: These laws ensure that human activities coexist peacefully with nature. Structures that blend in with the environment reduce visual and physical disruption, maintaining the natural beauty of the surroundings. Avoiding pollution helps safeguard air, water, and soil quality, protecting ecosystems and human health. Banning unsustainable practices like deforestation and overhunting preserves biodiversity and ensures the planet's longevity. Similarly, renewable energy options, such as waterwheels, minimise environmental impact and reduce carbon footprints. Like this, we can avoid the mistakes we have made and mitigate the effects of climate change. Instead of a heavily polluted world as we know it today, this land will be clean and natural, with sustainably generated energy and no pollution. This land will be safe and welcoming for everybody.

2. Cultural and Ethical Values

- Preservation of the traditions and cultures of indigenous peoples
- No engagement in illegal things like stealing, vandalising, etc.
- Trading handcrafted traditional items, minerals, and freshwater responsibly

Why we should implement these laws: These regulations champion respect for human and cultural diversity while promoting ethical behaviour. Preserving indigenous cultures not only safeguards heritage but also enriches humanity's collective knowledge and identity. By rejecting illegal activities, communities foster mutual trust and justice. Responsible trading practices protect natural resources and encourage ethical exchanges, enabling sustainable growth. #2 Like this, we can avoid the mistake that the British made of colonising Australia and almost wiping out the entire aboriginal population because they rejected the idea of indigenous peoples having rights or intelligence and treated them as animals. We welcome and preserve indigenous cultures and celebrate the cultural diversity of our newfound land.

3. Social Harmony and Exploration

- Exploration to discover new things, but not to exploit them
- No fighting—safe zone

Why we should implement these laws: These laws inspire curiosity and collaboration while preventing harm. Exploration with the intent to learn and appreciate rather than exploit ensures discoveries benefit all rather than a select few. Designating safe zones where all fighting is prohibited promotes peace and mutual respect, enabling diverse groups to coexist and work together toward common goals. These policies foster a foundation of trust, inclusion, and progress, building a

society where everyone thrives. #3 Like this, we can avoid things like war and sanguinary for land and resources to keep our land a positive environment, so everybody can stay peaceful together.

In conclusion, implementing the laws of environmental sustainability, cultural and ethical values, and social harmony and exploration will foster a magnificent world that coexists with nature, is peaceful to all and is ethical and equitable.