Writing Feedback

TERM 2 - 2025 | WEEK 4 - Writing | Year 5 Scholarship Essentials

## **Section 1:**

#1 "For more than six hundred years, I have stood sentinel in the heart of this meadow — a vast sea of grass that ripples with the wind's breath, ringed by forests that whisper ancient songs."

**Strengths:** Your opening creates a strong sense of time and place. The image of the oak as a "sentinel" shows the tree's important role as a watcher.

**Weakness:** Unclear time jumps  $\rightarrow$  Your piece moves between different time periods without clear signals to help readers follow when events happen. The phrase "Years slipped by, and she returned, but less often" doesn't tell us exactly how much time passed or help us understand the timeline of Sybil's life.

Exemplar: "Ten years passed before she returned, now a young woman of twenty-five, her steps slower and more careful than before."

#2 "She knelt, brushing the grass aside, pressing her hand to the earth just above the buried box. She could not have known it was there — not truly — yet her fingers lingered as if guided by memory written in blood and bone."

**Strengths:** Your writing shows the mysterious connection between family members well. The phrase "memory written in blood and bone" creates a strong image of family bonds.

**Weakness:** Missing character development  $\rightarrow$  Your piece doesn't give us enough information about who the second woman is or why she came to the tree. We don't know her name, her relationship to Sybil, or what brought her to this place, which makes it hard for readers to care about her story.

Exemplar: "This was Emma, Sybil's granddaughter, who had heard whispered stories about the old oak from her mother but never believed them until now."

#3 "One afternoon, beneath a sky the color of spilled milk, she buried something at my roots. A small, rusted tin box — its edges worn, the latch clumsy with age."

**Strengths:** Your description of the tin box is clear and helps us picture it easily. The detail about the "clumsy" latch makes the box feel real and old.

**Weakness:** Unexplained actions  $\rightarrow$  Your piece doesn't tell us why Sybil buried the box or what was inside it. This leaves readers confused about an important part of the story, making it harder to understand why this moment matters.

Exemplar: "Inside the box were her grandmother's wedding ring and a letter she had written but never sent, treasures too precious to keep but too important to throw away."

■ Your piece creates a beautiful feeling of time passing and family connections that span many years. The idea of the oak tree watching over generations is lovely and makes readers think about how families stay connected across time. However, your writing would be stronger if you gave us more specific details about the characters and their reasons for visiting the tree. Additionally, you could help readers follow the story better by being clearer about when things happen. Your descriptions of nature are very good, but the human parts of the story need more explanation. Also, try to show us more about what the characters are thinking and feeling, not just what they do. Furthermore, you could make the mystery of the buried box more interesting by giving us small hints about what might be inside. Finally, consider adding more dialogue or thoughts from the characters to help readers connect with them better.

Overall Score: 44/50

## Section 2:

#1 Through the eyes of the ancient oak

For more than six hundred years, I have stood sentinel in the heart of this meadow — a vast sea of grass that ripples with the wind's breath, ringed by forests that whisper ancient songs. My limbs have reached skyward through lightning and lullaby, my bark thickened with the scars of centuries, and my roots woven deep beneath the earth like veins through forgotten soil. Seasons have painted me with gold, stripped me bare, blanketed me in snow, and crowned me in green — and through them all, I have watched time unfold not in hours, but in heartbeats, in lifetimes.

And always, through the endless rhythm of bloom and decay, one family has returned to me — year after year, generation after generation, drawn by something older than memory, older than words.

The first I truly came to know was Sybil.

She was no more than a child when she arrived — a delicate thing with tangled hair and wide, wondering eyes. Her bare feet padded softly across the wild grass, barely bending the blades. She circled me like a moth drawn to a flame, humming under her breath, as though singing to the wind. Her fingers, small and warm, traced the lines in my bark with curiosity, pausing now and then as if she could decipher the stories etched into my skin by time. Her laughter — light, wild, and unafraid — rang through my branches like chimes in a summer breeze.

#2 One afternoon, beneath a sky the <del>color</del> [colour] of spilled milk, she buried something at my roots.

A small, rusted tin box — its edges worn, the latch clumsy with age. Her hands trembled as she lowered it into the hollow she had dug with a broken spoon. She whispered something I could not quite catch, but the words curled in the air like incense — solemn, secret, sacred. Then, with a final look, she pressed the soil down with reverent care.

Not long after, she took a stone and carved a mark into my bark: an S inside a circle, clean and deliberate, the lines sharp against my weathered hide. It stung, slightly, but I bore it proudly. It was a signature, a bond — a declaration that I was hers, and she was mine, in some small, strange way.

Years slipped by, and she returned, but less often.

Her once-carefree steps grew slower, heavier. The songs died on her lips. She no longer danced or laughed — instead, she stood in stillness, eyes distant, watching the meadow as if trying to remember how to belong in it. When she touched my bark, it was with a kind of longing, as if she were reaching through time to find something she had lost.

One autumn, as the sky burned with crimson and gold, she stayed longer than she had in years.

She rested her palm against me, her breath fogging in the chill air. Leaves swirled around her feet. Her face was lined, her eyes shadowed with the weight of years. I felt her sorrow settle against my bark like morning frost. Then, like the final leaf falling from my branches, she was gone. And for many seasons — many winters — I saw no trace of her.

But time, like the wind, always circles back.

Long after Sybil's footsteps faded into memory, another came — a young woman, not yet fully grown, with eyes like storm-washed stone. She walked with hesitation, as if searching for something unnamed yet deeply missed.

She paused where Sybil once stood.

Without a word, she reached out, her fingers hovering just above the mark on my trunk — the S now softened by time, faded but not forgotten. She touched it gently, as though it might vanish. Her breath caught in her throat.

I longed to speak to her — to tell her of the treasure buried beneath the soil, of Sybil's laughter and her sorrow, of the years and the winds and the whispers — but my voice was only the rustle of leaves, too faint to be heard by human ears.

Still, something stirred in her.

#3 She knelt, brushing the grass aside, pressing her hand to the earth just above the buried box. She could not have known it was there — not truly — yet her fingers lingered as if guided by memory written in blood and bone. The connection was there, ancient and invisible, like roots tangling beneath the surface.

I have seen this before.

I have watched them come and go, through plagues and wars, rising [the rising] of empires, through weddings and funerals, through songs and silence. Each life leaves its mark — in carvings, in offerings, in the air itself. The meadow remembers. I remember.

Generations rise like spring's green shoots, and fall like autumn's leaves. But they always return — drawn by a tether they cannot name.

And I remain.

Rooted in earth, crowned by sky.

The ancient oak. Keeper of secrets. Witness to wonder.

Guardian of a legacy written in rust and rain, in laughter and longing, in lives that echo like wind through my leaves.