Writing Feedback

TERM 2 - 2025 | Day 1 - Writing Homework | Year 4 Reading & Writing

Section 1:

#1 "Mary had just come from her own private music class and got welcomed by a bunch of staring faces. 'How about you perform to us.' said Mr. Magam"

Strengths: You've created an immediately tense situation that hooks the reader. The dialogue introduces conflict quickly.

Dialogue formatting \rightarrow Your dialogue punctuation needs attention. When a character speaks, the punctuation should be inside the quotation marks, and there should be a comma before speech attribution. Also, there's no full stop after "to us".

Exemplar: "How about you perform for us," said Mr. Magam with a challenging smile.

#2 "Mary's hand trembles as she grabbed her saxophone to perform in front of the whole class. As her classmates cheered for her usual shyness went into thin air."

Strengths: You've captured Mary's nervousness well with the trembling hands. The transformation from fear to confidence shows character development.

Tense consistency → Your tenses shift from present ("trembles") to past ("grabbed"). Also, the second sentence structure makes it unclear what happens when classmates cheer.

Exemplar: Mary's hands trembled as she grabbed her saxophone to perform in front of the whole class. As her classmates cheered for her, her usual shyness vanished into thin air.

#3 "When Mary was checking that if her saxophone wasn't working, she heard a squeaky voice 'Help I was in the middle of conducting a beautiful orchestra and you ruined it with the too loud playing!' it said with a grumpy voice."

Strengths: Your introduction of the magical element is surprising and creates curiosity. The character of the mysterious voice has personality through dialogue.

Sentence structure and dialogue formatting \rightarrow The sentence is overly complex with multiple ideas. The dialogue needs quotation marks throughout and proper attribution.

Exemplar: When Mary checked if her saxophone was working properly, she heard a squeaky voice. "Help! I was in the middle of conducting a beautiful orchestra and you ruined it with your too loud playing!" it said grumpily.

■ Your story has a wonderful magical premise that would captivate young readers! The idea of a tiny orchestra conductor inside a saxophone is clever and full of potential. To improve your piece, focus on

clearer transitions between events. For instance, the shift from Mary's nervousness to sudden confidence needs more development. Also, the magical element appears quite abruptly—consider adding small hints earlier that something unusual is happening with the instrument. Your dialogue shows character personalities well, but needs proper formatting to help readers follow who's speaking. Try reading your story aloud to catch awkward phrases and run-on sentences. Adding sensory details would make your story more immersive—what does the tiny conductor look like? What does the magical music sound like compared to normal saxophone playing? Your ending leaves readers wanting more about this musical adventure!

Score: 36/50

Section 2:

Mary had just come from her own private music class and got welcomed by a bunch of [a group of] staring faces. #1 "How about you perform to us." ["How about you perform for us,"] said Mr. Magam.

#2 Mary's hand trembles [Mary's hands trembled] as she grabbed her saxophone to perform in front of the whole class. As her classmates cheered for her usual shyness went into thin air. [As her classmates cheered for her, her usual shyness vanished into thin air.]

As she played, she noticed that she could hear violin notes, then flute notes after a while [after a while,] she could hear a whole orchestra. The whole class looked stunned at Mary, they heard it too.

#3 When Mary was checking that if her saxophone wasn't working, she heard a squeaky voice [When Mary checked if her saxophone was working properly, she heard a squeaky voice.] "Help I was in the middle of conducting a beautiful orchestra and you ruined it with the [your] too loud playing!" it said with a grumpy voice. "But you ruined my act!" replied Mary. The teacher who'd snapped out of his statue mode said, "what [What] about you can get out of there with your band and perform somewhere else?"