

Section 1

#1: Opening Scene (First Paragraph)

Strengths:

- You create immediate tension by showing James searching desperately through his drawers, which hooks the reader's attention right away.
- The physical action of slamming his hand creates a vivid picture that helps readers feel James's frustration.

Weakness: Unclear Connection Between Actions → The progression from searching through drawers to slamming the table feels sudden and disconnected. You write "Fumbling through his drawers one by one, James hurriedly scanned for his book, even though he knew that it was forever lost," which creates confusion—why is he searching if he already knows it's lost? Then the scene jumps to him slamming the table without showing us what triggered this specific moment of rage. The reader needs to understand what happens between searching and exploding in anger.

Exemplar: *After checking the final drawer and finding nothing but old papers, James's last spark of hope vanished. He turned to the wooden table and slammed his hand down with such force that the old room shuddered.*

#2: Memory Sequence (Second Paragraph)

Strengths:

- You effectively communicate that the book held deep sentimental value by explaining it was his grandfather's last gift.
- The detail about the book containing "all their memories" helps readers understand why James is so upset.

Weakness: Vague Description of Memories → You tell us that memories came "quick as lightning" and that the book "contained all their memories, all the fun they've had together," but you never show us what these memories actually were. What specific moments did James and his grandfather share?

What made their relationship special? Without concrete examples, the emotional weight feels hollow. Readers need at least one or two specific memories to truly connect with James's loss and understand why this book mattered so much.

Exemplar: *Memories flooded James's mind—afternoons when Grandfather taught him to identify birds by their calls, evenings spent sketching flowers in this very garden, the warmth of his grandfather's laugh when James got the names wrong.*

#3: Resolution Scene (Final Paragraph)

Strengths:

- You show character growth by having James reach an understanding rather than simply recovering the lost book.
- The realisation that "memories hold the most powerful connection of all" provides a meaningful theme about what truly matters.

Weakness: Rushed Emotional Shift → James's transformation from desperate grief to peaceful acceptance happens too quickly and feels unearned. You write "After a while, he returned to his room, realising something that the bird had shown him," but this "after a while" doesn't give enough space for such a major emotional change. His grief was intense—he was "quivering in rage" and believed "this was the end"—yet he suddenly feels "satisfied at last" and like "a lock had opened deep inside him" within the same page. Real emotional healing, especially from losing a connection to a deceased loved one, takes time and struggle.

Exemplar: *James sat on the bench long after the storm passed, watching the bird return to its nest again and again. Slowly, a strange thought began forming. The bird didn't need the stick to be a bird. Perhaps he didn't need the book to remember Grandfather. The grief still ached in his chest, but for the first time since the loss, he could breathe a little easier.*

■ Your piece shows promise in exploring a meaningful theme about memory and loss. The central idea—that memories matter more than physical objects—is valuable and age-appropriate. However, your writing would benefit from adding more specific details throughout. Instead of telling us James

had memories with his grandfather, show us one or two actual moments they shared together. This would make readers care more about what James lost.

Additionally, your pacing needs adjustment. The emotional journey feels rushed, particularly the ending where James moves from deep grief to peace too quickly. Real feelings don't change that fast, so you might spend more time showing James struggling with his realisation. Perhaps he could resist the lesson from the bird at first, or feel angry that a simple bird seems to cope better than he does.

Also, consider strengthening the connection between the bird scene and James's understanding. Right now, the bird drops a stick and gives up, and suddenly James understands everything. You could make this clearer by showing James's thoughts more gradually, perhaps having him question why the bird gave up, then slowly connecting this to his own situation. Your writing would feel more natural if you let James work through his emotions step by step rather than jumping to the answer.

Overall Score: 43/50

Section 2:

Fumbling through his drawers one by one, James hurriedly scanned for his book, even though he knew that it was forever lost. ~~Enraged~~ [Finally giving up, enraged], he slammed his hand down ~~at~~ [on] the wooden table with such force that the old room shuddered and things fell ~~down the table, onto~~ [from the table onto] the floor. He collapsed, howling[—his] for his fist burned like lava. ~~It was lost. This was the end.~~ [The book was truly gone.] #1

Memories came into James' mind quick as lightning, going through the entire history of ~~him, and the~~ ~~very~~ [him and the] book he had been holding only moments ~~ago~~ [before]. It was his last gift from his grandfather[.] ~~before he~~ [Before Grandfather] had passed away[.] It [the book] contained all their memories, all the fun they've had together, and it was lost. Gone [—now gone] without a trace. His only connection to him was finally lost. Now, the memories were slowly replaced by others[—moments] ~~Moments~~ of when he ~~lost~~ [had lost] similar things that reminded him of his grandfather, and how they ~~were lost~~ [too had vanished]. His endless struggle against losing the

invaluable objects, all his effort to keep the items safe and sound, had failed completely. Quivering in rage, he stormed outside the house. #2

Outside, the sky rolled with thunder, and lightning flashed. It seemed to mock James, laughing at his rage. He walked into his garden, examining the rows of flowers as if worrying that he would someday lose them ~~to~~ [too]. Eventually, he sat ~~back~~ [down] on a bench[and] ~~and watched~~ [watched] a family of birds nested ~~on~~ [in] a tree, like he always did when he needed to calm down. The birds walked around, pecking at things in their nest. One bird seemed to ~~favour~~ [favour] a stick it found, clutching it in ~~his~~ [its] beak and showing it off around. But then lightning ~~let loose on~~ [struck] a spot near ~~to~~ [near] the tree, and James nearly jumped out of his skin. The birds, too, were frightened. The one holding the stick flapped around, carelessly dropping the stick ~~in~~ [into] the wind. Seeing it ~~floating~~ [floating] away, it launched itself after it, determined.

'Poor little thing,' James thought with an amused glance, 'it's going to fail at it, just like me.' It did, and the stick was blown away with the wind. But the strange part was[that] the bird only flew a few ~~metres~~ [metres] before coming back to its nest, not chasing after the stick at all. He raised his eyebrow; he ~~was not expecting~~ [hadn't expected] that at all. His eyes narrowed on the bird that had given up, and his mind began processing what ~~just happened~~ [had just happened].

After a while, he returned to his room, realising something that the bird had shown him. He wasn't really searching for the book, but searching for his memories, and they were never stolen at all. The more he thought about it, the more sense it made. He was trying to get the objects because ~~it~~ [they] held a connection between the pair, but memories hold the most powerful connection of all. Satisfied at last, James sat down in his chair, feeling like a lock had opened deep inside him. #3