

Section 1

#1: Introduction and Thesis Statement (Opening paragraph)

Strengths:

- Your opening clearly states your position on the topic, letting readers know exactly what to expect from your writing.
- You've included a preview of your main points (companionship, service to humans, and health benefits), which creates a helpful roadmap for your piece.

Vague Introduction → Whilst you state your position, your opening relies on the phrase "A question asked since the start of time," which is too general and doesn't capture the reader's attention with a specific or engaging hook. Consider beginning with a more concrete observation or surprising fact that immediately draws readers in. The phrase "let me guarantee you something for sure" also sounds informal and weakens your authority—you're making a strong claim, but the casual language doesn't match the seriousness of your argument. *Instead, you might write: "For centuries, humans have debated whether dogs or cats make better companions. However, evidence clearly demonstrates that dogs offer superior benefits through their companionship, service capabilities, and positive effects on our health."*

#2: Second Body Paragraph (Paragraph about service dogs)

Strengths:

- You've included excellent evidence from the American Humane Society Organisation with specific statistics (73% improvement), which strengthens your argument significantly.
- The personal testimony from Christina provides a real-world example that makes your point more relatable and convincing.

Unclear Connection → After presenting strong evidence about service dogs helping veterans and first responders, you write, "This shows that dogs help humans; they're not attention-seeking or dependent on you." This statement confuses your message because you're suddenly defending dogs against criticisms you haven't clearly addressed earlier. Why mention "attention-seeking" here when your paragraph is about service dogs saving lives? The transition feels awkward and disconnects from your

main point about service dogs. Your reader might wonder what "attention-seeking" has to do with trained service animals. ***You could strengthen this by writing: "This evidence demonstrates that dogs provide essential, life-changing support to people who need them most, making them invaluable companions in ways cats simply cannot match."***

#3: Third Body Paragraph (Paragraph about health benefits)

Strengths:

- You've incorporated evidence from credible sources like Harvard Medical School and the National Library of Medicine, which adds authority to your claims.
- Your paragraph addresses a practical concern (motivation to exercise) that many readers can relate to personally.

Underdeveloped Reasoning → You introduce the Chameleon Effect with a lengthy quote about "non-conscious mimicry of postures, mannerisms, facial expressions," but you don't explain clearly how this scientific concept actually connects to dogs encouraging exercise. The quote talks about copying behaviours from other people, not animals, so your reader is left wondering: "How exactly does mimicking a dog's behaviour work?" You've jumped from a complex scientific theory to "This proves that by having a dog, you can potentially be influenced by it" without building that bridge. The connection feels incomplete. ***You might explain it more clearly: "Because dogs naturally lead active lifestyles through regular walks and play, the Chameleon Effect suggests that owners may unconsciously adopt more active habits themselves, gradually building exercise into their daily routines."***

■ Your piece presents a clear argument with good organisation and some strong evidence, but the depth of your reasoning could be improved in several areas. Whilst you've gathered impressive sources from Harvard Medical School and the American Humane Society, you sometimes include them without fully explaining how they support your specific points. For instance, when you mention the Chameleon Effect, you need to spend more time showing your reader exactly how this scientific idea applies to dogs and exercise, rather than expecting them to make the connection themselves. Additionally, your comparisons between dogs and cats occasionally become too focused on criticising cats ("a creature that uses you only when it needs something") rather than highlighting what makes dogs genuinely valuable. Your strongest moments occur when you let the evidence speak for itself, such as Christina's testimony about her service dog—this is powerful because it's specific and concrete. To improve the substance of your writing, focus on building stronger logical connections between your evidence and your claims. Also, consider developing your ideas about companionship more thoroughly

by exploring different types of dog-human relationships beyond just "waiting at home" or "playing fetch." Your conclusion's metaphor about stars and constellations is creative, but it might be more effective if you referenced specific points from your essay to remind readers why dogs matter, rather than introducing entirely new imagery at the end.

Overall Score: 43/50

Section 2

#1 Dogs or Cats? A question asked since the start of time. Everyone is divided and has their own opinions, but let me guarantee you something for sure: dogs are far superior to cats for an abundance of reasons, including their companionship, service to humans, and the health benefits you get from raising one. ~~While~~ [Whilst] some people may prefer the quiet company of cats, we must not forget that a dog is a man's best friend.

Firstly, dogs are better than cats because of their unwavering affection. Imagine a blue sky, you're outside with your furry best friend running carefree. You fall onto the soft, lush grass, giggling as he wags his tail, bringing you back the ball. Now imagine staying at home in the darkness, away from the wonderful adventures outside—isolated. Cats interact far less with their owners in comparison to dogs, and when they do, it's often out of necessity. A cat is a creature that doesn't let you go out even if it stays at home—a creature that uses you only when it needs something, and often doesn't even acknowledge your presence. Dogs are the spark of joy in your life— always eager to spend their time with you. They are the ones who wait for you when you get home, unlike some others who disappear for hours and even days, only to come back when they need something. Can we really call this "independence" when it feels like emotional distance?

#2 Furthermore, dogs are better than cats because they can be trained as service dogs. Cats, on the other hand, tend to be more passive, often content with staying still, grooming and silently observing. Dogs save lives and have helped thousands of people. According to the American Humane Society Organisation, "service dogs can reduce stress and anxiety levels, mitigate depression, ease social reintegration, provide comfort, and restore confidence in affected veterans and first responders by more than 73%." This is what Christina, a Woodland firefighter and EMT, had to say: "Freja has been the

most wonderful partner for me. She has learned nightmare and anxiety interruption, does deep pressure therapy and crowd control. On top of all this, she gives me constant love and attention. She is my best friend." This shows that dogs help humans; they're not attention-seeking or dependent on you. They unquestionably love you and are always willing to help.

#3 Finally, dogs are better than cats because raising one can bring many health benefits. Now, I know that you don't like exercising. No one does nowadays— not because you don't care about your health, but because of laziness and lack of motivation. However, exercise is crucial for a healthy lifestyle, so why not make it easier by taking a dog with you on a walk or run? Dogs are very active and always energetic. By taking your dog, you can cancel out laziness, thus regaining the consistency and motivation you lost when having a cat who wanted to stay indoors for the majority of the day, fiddling with the toys you buy them. By simply choosing a dog rather than a cat, you will see many positive differences in your lifestyle. This is backed up by the Chameleon Effect. The National Library of Medicine states, "The chameleon effect refers to non-conscious mimicry of the postures, mannerisms, facial expressions, and other behaviours of one's interaction partners, such that one's behaviour passively and unintentionally changes to match that of others in one's current social environment." This proves that by having a dog, you can potentially be influenced by it to have a healthy lifestyle. Dr Thomas Lee, the co-chief of Harvard Health Publishing, states in an article by Harvard Medical School, "People who have dogs live longer than people who have cats, with dogs naturally causing the owners to be more active." National libraries, master doctors, and even one of the best universities in the world all agree on this. So, should there even be a second thought?

To conclude, dogs are far better than cats for various reasons, including their warm interactions with humans, their ability to save lives as service dogs, and even helping you live a healthier, longer life. Dogs are like the stars in the night sky. Their affection is the light that warms even the darkest moments, their guidance is a glow that shows us the way, and their playful energy is radiant in a life like the night sky. Cats may drift as comets, nice to see but not always there, but dogs are the constellations we can always count on. So the next time you stumble across this controversial question, you know what to choose: dogs.