

Section 1

#1 "No one ever went into the cellar beneath the abandoned chapel – not since the flood blackened its doors and time swallowed its name."

Strengths:

- Your opening sentence creates mystery and makes readers curious about what happened to the chapel
- The phrase "time swallowed its name" uses interesting imagery to show how old and forgotten the place is

Inconsistent Setting Setup → Your writing mentions "the cellar beneath the abandoned chapel" in the first sentence, but then introduces "a trapdoor hidden out on the street" in the second sentence. When Arthur falls through, he wonders if he's "in the abandoned chapel" and finds himself in a room with treasure boxes. This creates confusion about where Arthur actually is. Is the trapdoor leading to the cellar you mentioned at the start? Are the cellar and the room with treasure boxes the same place? The connection between these locations isn't clear, making it difficult for readers to picture where the story is happening.

Exemplar: *No one ever went into the rooms beneath the abandoned chapel on Surry Street – not since the flood blackened its doors and time swallowed its name. A hidden trapdoor on the cobblestone street led directly down to these forgotten chambers.*

#2 "After that, he stayed stationary for a long time before waking up. He jolted up, and looked around. 'I wonder where this is,' Arthur thought to himself. 'But it definitely does not look like a new place. I must be in the abandoned chapel! Wait, is that a door with a keyhole? Maybe I can get out of here from there.'"

Strengths:

- Your writing shows Arthur's thoughts clearly, helping readers understand what he's thinking
- The discovery of the door moves the story forward naturally

Missing Sensory Details and Rushed Pacing → This section moves through important moments very quickly without helping readers experience what Arthur experiences. After falling through a trapdoor and being unconscious, Arthur wakes up in a mysterious place, but your writing doesn't describe what he sees, hears, or feels. What does the room look like? Is it dark or light? Does it smell musty? Is it cold? Without these details, readers can't picture the scene. Additionally, phrases like "stayed stationary for a long time" tell us time passed but don't show us anything interesting about that time. This makes the story feel rushed rather than building tension and atmosphere.

Exemplar: *When Arthur's eyes finally opened, he blinked in the dim light filtering through cracks in the ancient stone ceiling above. The air tasted damp and earthy. As he sat up slowly, his hand pressed against something soft – the dusty velvet of an old bed. The room around him was small and shadowy, with cobwebs draped across the corners like grey curtains.*

#3 "He soon got the cops to come. That same day Arthur made this face onto every single newspaper. A day after making the newspapers, Arthur called his band mates to come to at his house."

Strengths:

- Your writing shows that Arthur becomes famous, which is an exciting development
- The decision to reunite the band connects back to Arthur's passion for music

Unclear Motivation and Underdeveloped Ending → Your story's ending raises questions that aren't answered. Arthur "raced out the abandoned chapel as fast as a horse, not even wondering why the instruments were there at the first place." This is puzzling because discovering unused instruments in a mysterious underground room would make most people very curious. Why doesn't Arthur wonder about this? The phrase "Arthur made this face onto every single newspaper" is also confusing – what does "made this face" mean? Did he smile? Look surprised? More importantly, the story doesn't explain why finding old instruments in a hidden room would make newspaper headlines or help Arthur's band. The ending jumps from discovering the room to newspaper fame to band success without showing the connections between these events.

Exemplar: *The police were amazed by Arthur's discovery. "These instruments once belonged to the famous Surry Street Orchestra," explained the chief inspector, "which vanished during the great flood of 1885." News reporters arrived within hours, and by evening, Arthur's photograph appeared on the front page of every newspaper, with headlines reading: "Local Musician Solves 140-Year-Old Mystery." The publicity reminded Arthur why he'd loved performing, and he knew exactly what to do next.*

■ Your piece tells an interesting story about discovery and second chances, but it needs more development to help readers fully understand and enjoy Arthur's adventure. The core idea – a musician falling into a hidden room and finding instruments that reignite his passion – has potential, but right now the story moves too quickly through important moments. When you write, think about slowing down during exciting parts. Instead of telling us "he stayed stationary for a long time," show us what's happening during that time. What is Arthur noticing? What is he feeling?

Your story would benefit from clearer connections between events. For example, the beginning mentions a cellar beneath a chapel, but later it's unclear if that's where Arthur lands. Readers need to understand the geography of your story's setting. Additionally, the ending jumps quickly from finding instruments to newspaper fame without explaining why this discovery matters so much. Consider adding a paragraph that explains what makes these instruments special or historically important.

The character of Arthur needs more development throughout the story. What does he look like? How does he feel about not playing music anymore? Why did his band stop playing a month ago? These details would make readers care more about Arthur's success at the end. Also, think about Arthur's reactions – would someone who just fell through a trapdoor into an underground room really not wonder why musical instruments are there? Adding his curiosity and thoughts would make the story more realistic and engaging for your readers.

Overall Score: 41/50

Section 2:

~~No one ever went into the cellar beneath the abandoned chapel – not since the flood blackened its doors and time swallowed its name. There was even a trapdoor hidden out on the street, but nobody had set foot on it until now.~~ [#1 No one ever went into the rooms beneath the abandoned chapel on Surry Street – not since the flood blackened its doors and time swallowed its name. A hidden trapdoor on the cobblestone street, covered in years of dust and grime, led directly down to these forgotten chambers. Nobody had set foot on it – until now.] The old musician, Arthur, was slowly taking steps

forward on Surry Street. All of a sudden, a trapdoor that blended with the rocky road opened up so ~~quick~~ [quickly] you would miss it if you blinked. As it was ~~dinner-time~~ [dinner-time], absolutely nobody was in the street ~~with a ton of fancy restaurants~~ [despite the many fine restaurants lining both sides].

Arthur landed hard on a fluffy bed, but unfortunately, he ~~laid~~ [lay] unconscious for ten seconds or so before the trapdoor closed up fully. ~~After that, he stayed stationary for a long time before waking up. He jolted up, and looked around.~~ [#2 When Arthur's eyes finally opened, he blinked in the dim light filtering through cracks in the ancient stone ceiling above. The air tasted damp and earthy. As he sat up slowly, his hand pressed against something soft – the dusty velvet of an old bed. The room around him was small and shadowy, with cobwebs draped across the corners like grey curtains.]

"I wonder where this is," Arthur thought to himself. "But it definitely does not look like a new place. I must be in the abandoned chapel! Wait, is that a door with a keyhole? Maybe I can get out of here from there."

Arthur ~~pushes~~ [pushed] the ~~doors~~ [door] as hard as he ~~can~~ [could], but the door would not budge. He looked around for any sort of key, and he spotted a huge rusty key on top of a brown cardboard box. He twisted the key in the keyhole and it swung open with an eerie, creaking noise. Inside, he saw one door and many treasure boxes lying around [;] all of them ~~being~~ [were] made almost entirely out of rusty gold. When he peered inside the nearest gold box, his eyes widened in pure surprise. It was a clarinet that was put together, and a label mentioned that it had not been used before. ~~Now Arthur was shocked. He gaped.~~ [Arthur gasped in astonishment.] He then picked up the instrument he plays even now, and tried to talk, but no words came out. The old man immediately started to play the clarinet = [-] fast and well. He knew he ~~has~~ [had] to take it home = [-] he had found it. Arthur remembered the days before with his band, and decided to call them to come back. Arthur raced out ~~the~~ [of the] abandoned chapel as fast as a horse, not even wondering why the instruments were there ~~at the first place~~ [in the first place]. He did not take any ~~instruments~~ [other instruments], but he was going to tell the police about it [them]. ~~He soon got the cops to come. That same day Arthur made this face onto every single newspaper.~~ [#3 The police were amazed by Arthur's discovery. "These instruments once belonged to the famous Surry Street Orchestra," explained the chief inspector, "which vanished during the great flood of 1885." News reporters arrived within hours, and by evening, Arthur's photograph appeared on the front page of every newspaper, with headlines reading: "Local Musician Solves 140-Year-Old Mystery."]

A day after making the newspapers, Arthur called his band ~~mates~~ [members] to come to ~~at~~ [to] his house. Within an hour, every single one of them ~~were~~ [was] there. After setting up, the band started to

play their instruments. Even though they were squeaking a lot after not playing their instruments for a month, they soon were as good as before and signed up for the ~~battle~~ [Battle] of the ~~bands~~ [Bands] and their ~~career~~ [careers] went off ~~great~~ [greatly] again.